

**FEERICK LYNCH MacCARTNEY & NUGENT<sup>PLLC</sup>**  
ATTORNEYS AT LAW

ROCKLAND COUNTY OFFICE  
96 SOUTH BROADWAY  
SOUTH NYACK, NEW YORK 10960  
TEL. 845-353-2000 FAX. 845-353-2789

DENNIS E.A. LYNCH  
DONALD J. FEERICK, JR.  
J. DAVID MacCARTNEY, JR.  
BRIAN D. NUGENT\*  
MARY E. MARZOLLA\*

ORANGE COUNTY OFFICE  
6 DEPOT STREET, SUITE 202  
WASHINGTONVILLE, NEW YORK 10992  
*(Not for service of papers)*

WESTCHESTER COUNTY OFFICE  
235 MAIN STREET, SUITE 330  
WHITE PLAINS, NEW YORK 10601  
*(Not for service of papers)*

JENNIFER M. FEERICK  
STEPHEN M. HONAN\*+  
ALAK SHAH\*  
PATRICK A. KNOWLES\*  
JOHN J. KOLESAR III  
PATRICK J. MCGORMAN

OF COUNSEL  
DONALD J. ROSS  
DAVID J. RESNICK  
KEVIN F. HOBBS  
MICHAEL K. STANTON, JR.

[www.flmpllc.com](http://www.flmpllc.com)

\*LICENSED ALSO IN NEW JERSEY  
+LICENSED ALSO IN CONNECTICUT

*All correspondence must be sent to Rockland County Office*

October 26, 2018

*Via E-Filing*

Hon. Judith C. McCarthy  
United States Magistrate Judge  
South District of New York  
300 Quarropas Street  
White Plains, New York 10601-4150

Re: National Association for the Advancement of Colored People,  
v. East Ramapo Central School District  
Docket No. 17 Civ. 8943

Dear Judge McCarthy:

The undersigned has just been contacted by Rabbi Yehuda Oshry concerning the matter above-captioned. I have received today the October 25, 2018 correspondence sent by Counsel for the Plaintiffs to you. As I have not met with Rabbi Oshry after receiving that correspondence and have only had a very brief discussion verbally with him, I write to request the opportunity after speaking with Rabbi Oshry to respond on this Monday with regard to said correspondence.

With the very preliminary information I have received today, I believe there is a substantial question whether Rabbi Oshry was properly served with any Subpoena. Moreover, to the extent that any Discovery sought may involve religious privileges or First Amendment rights, that also should be explored by myself with Rabbi Oshry and ascertained so Your Honor can be

FEERICK LYNCH MACCARTNEY & NUGENT, ESQS.  
OCTOBER 26, 2018  
PAGE TWO

so informed in a responsive letter. I therefore request the opportunity to respond on this Monday, October 29, 2018 to the Court and Opposing Counsel on said October 25, 2018 letter.

Finally, I am currently involved in discussions with Opposing Counsel with regard to the potential production of another Witness and I will certainly continue in good faith with those discussions as well as attempt to resolve this matter in good faith once I am able to ascertain the full background concerning this matter. Thanking the Court for its time and consideration of this request, I remain,

Very truly yours,



Dennis E. A. Lynch

DEAL/sd

cc: Claudia T. Salomon, Esq.